Meeting called to order by Werksma at 5:30 pm.

Present: Barbara VanHorssen, Louann Werksma, Shyle Lyons, Reyna Masko, Wes McGee, Angela Tran, Rhonda Kleyan and Shannon Farmer. Each member indicated verbally their city and state location.

Absent: Madigan Lautzenheiser, Alexa Redick and Dennis Swartout,

Approval of Agenda: Motion by VanHorssen, Seconded by Masko to approve agenda as amended with addition of showing DEI video and discussion of complaint submitted to HRC and removal of strategic planning session. Strategic planning discussion was added to old business. All in favor.

Approval of Minutes: Minutes of October 22, 2020 approved with one sentence change; motion by VanHorssen, seconded by Farmer, all in favor.

Welcome Guests: Ashley Latsch of City of Grand Haven operating the Zoom and monitoring Facebook Livestream. City Council member Mike Dora. Grand Haven Chamber of Commerce member Nancy Manglos and GHAPS staff member Brian Wheeler.

General call to the audience- No comments at this time.

Liaison Reports: N/A

Old Business:

a. Strategic Planning Part II – Werksma reviewed an email from Al Vanderberg regarding the strategic planning session scheduled for this HRC meeting. Based on Vanderberg's email the commission decided to change the strategic planning process.

   The body of the email is:

   Tomorrow's strategic planning session for the HRC is scheduled for tomorrow night and will be held by Zoom.

   We are feeling a bit unprepared for the session. Reyna contacted me in September and said that the group wants to begin 2021 with a concrete list of objectives to attack. We had set up a meeting with several folks to talk about this via Zoom on September 30 and the meeting didn't happen.

   I have worked with over 70 orgs on strategic planning but never via Zoom and I'm concerned that you will not be pleased with the outcome tomorrow when I don't have a clear picture of what we are trying to accomplish. I have a few questions as to what has transpired since February 27 when we completed the last session:
1. Were the strategic planning documents ever put into a strategic plan?
2. Was anything accomplished in the plan if one was created?
3. Were any resources attached to the HRC to accomplish any of the objectives?

If the answer to these questions is “no” then I’d like to propose a different approach. We are willing to help again but maybe do it in late February again which is just before the City begins its budget process. Then the planning will be fresh before the City budget is developed and adopted in anticipation of the July 1 beginning of the City fiscal year. I really think the plan should work with the budget on this sort of timeline to make sure the plan is resourced and on the same schedule as other City activity.

We do have some ideas for how we might do an online strategic planning and will plan both options for late February.

Werksma reviewed some of the work accomplished at the February strategic planning session. VanHorssen suggested updating the work done in February to add the impact of COVID 19 to the strategic plan. The group decided this could be accomplished via a subcommittee. Masko volunteered to chair this subcommittee. McGee, Farmer and Werksma volunteered for the subcommittee. Tran and Swartout are working as a subcommittee with City Council member Ryan Cummins to revise HRC policies and procedures. Tran provided an update at this time as these changes coincide with strategic planning. Tran explained the subcommittee members have struggled to coordinate their schedules but are hoping to meet soon. Kley reported that based on state laws surrounding public meetings all commission members are required to have an email or phone number available to the public. The HRC roster is on the City website but this commission has requested personal information be removed from the roster. The group decided to have email addresses added back unto the public roster.

**New Business:**

i.

a. **HRC Complaint**- On November 5, 2020 the HRC received a complaint via email. Werksma read the complaint to the group. The complaint is attached. Werksma reported the steps taken to date.
   a. Werksma spoke with Mayor Robert Monetza
   b. Vanhorssen volunteered to participate in the investigation. She spoke with Ryan Cummins, City Council member. Her notes are:

   **Quick Summary:**
   Ryan wishes he could have a do over to get more time to think about it. Mike thinks everyone deserves a second chance.
   According to Ryan:
   Roger Cotner called him about the appointment because he had some reservations due to the deer cull issue and a letter to the editor. Ryan talked to Bob who told him he thought Nancy would be objective. Roger asked if Ryan wanted to see the materials and Ryan declined. He knew the deer cull had been a hot topic and thought that Nancy had the experience and education to serve and had no other reason for concerns. He also received a text from Josh Brugger that he had concerns.
It was at the meeting when Denny read the statement that he heard it for the first time. It was not provided to the council beforehand. When people started speaking it felt like the usual divisions. Mike Fritz was in favor. Mike Dora said he had talked to Nancy and that made Ryan more comfortable. Ryan thought that she was qualified to serve – but had pause over the LGBTQ term. He listened to the mayor say that something from years ago in a moment of anger was being brought up and that it shouldn’t be held against her.

Ryan said he had never experienced this situation before and he wish he had known about the letter ahead of time. He wishes in retrospect that the decision had been tabled, but it didn’t occur to him as an option at time. The vote continued to bother him, but the email had already gone out telling her she could be sworn in any time. He had a conversation with City Manager Pat McGinnis about his concerns, but McGinnis didn’t believe there was anything that could be done now that action had already been taken. Cummins felt the vote was rushed and is bothered by the fact that Bob ended the discussion so quickly. He thinks that was because Bob didn’t want to get into a rehash of the deer cull argument. Ryan also states that he does not know Nagtzamaa, has never met her, and does not know if she harbors anti LGBTQ or other discriminatory beliefs. His conclusion is that he wishes he could have it back to work through more.

He added that the Mayor has broad authority and he generally trusts him. This as a unique circumstance. He hates to be presented with new information on the spot and be called on to vote on it without having time to consider it.

Some details of the appointment of the Duncan Park commissioner at the November 2, 2020 City Council meeting:

The Council voted 4:1 in favor of this appointment.

Council member Scott brought the email to attention of the council at the meeting.
The email was sent to the City’s former Mayor 6-8 years ago.

Comments and conversation regarding the complaint:

a. McGee asked if the email was made public when it was originally sent to the former mayor? No one present knew the answer. McGee also stated he believes this is a matter to be resolved by the City Council rather than the HRC.

b. Masko questioned what role the HRC will take in this because the HRC is working on its policies and procedures and its complaint process. She also asked why the person would be allowed to serve on a board that represents Grand Haven residents when she has behaved so poorly in the past. McGee agreed with Masko.

c. Council member Mike Dora was present as a guest. With his permission Werksma read the transcript from Vanhorssen of her conversation with him. It is as follows:

Denny [Scott] called Mike [Dora] about the incident, which he said took place 6 to 8 years ago. Mike talked to Geri [McCaleb] and to Bob [Monetza] about this before the Council Meeting. Bob had talked to Nancy [Nagtzamaa] about her demeanor in the past and felt she could be more professional now. Mike then called Nancy himself. They talked for 30-45 minutes. He said Nancy didn’t recall her exact wording in the letter, but Mike felt she had moved beyond those views. In his conversation they did not address the letter itself. His general feeling was that he didn’t think she would do it again today. He did ask about the possibility
of another deer cull and if that would be problematic for her. He felt that she would be able to talk about it without being over emotional or demeaning people. He didn’t talk to Nancy about the LGBTQ reference but Bob assured Mike that she has no issues. “She is not a racist and has no bad feelings toward anyone.” He went on to say she has a son that is openly gay.

d. Council member Mike Dora explained his reasoning behind his yes vote for this appointment. He stated council members aren’t given an opportunity to interview applicant. This is exclusively done by the Mayor. After receiving the information about the email sent to the former mayor he did call the applicant. He made his decision in part because the current mayor said he believes she will be a good Duncan Park board member. He also stated he believes in forgiveness and giving people a second chance. He believes being an unforgiving community breeds hate and that goes against the community he wants to be a part of.

e. Farmer stated she believes in forgiveness but because Grand Haven is fighting so hard against a hateful stigma this appointment leaves her with a bad taste in her mouth.

f. McGee pointed out this should not be talked about as a race issue but rather a discrimination issue.

g. Vanhorssen added details about her conversation with Ryan Cummins. The complainant questioned if his complaint should be brought to the MI Civil Rights Commission. Cummins has experience with the civil rights commission. He explained to Vanhorssen that anyone can submit a complaint to the commission. However, based on his experience the complaint doesn’t rise to the level that would initiate an investigation. Cummins stated that the aggrieved party was really the former mayor and perhaps she is who should have brought the complaint at the time she received the email.

h. Lyons questioned if the complainant has been provided this MI Civil Rights Commission information. Werksma said that it had.

i. Werksma proposed that she will provide a summary to the group and then the group will make a decision regarding the next steps.

j. Masko stated that she hoped that the City Council will discuss this and make a decision on how to address a controversial applicant in the future.

k. Vanhorssen stated a positive outcome would be the ability to have open conversations with City Council about these types of issues. She also questioned if the HRC could ask the city council members to speak with the new appointee about this email. Ask how she feels now and if she regrets her words?

l. Masko asked if a letter from the city council to complainant would be appropriate. Is there a procedure for this type of situation?

m. Werksma asked if an appointee can be removed? Vanhorssen stated that, during her conversation with council member Cummins, he stated he had asked city manager Pat McGinnis and McGinnis explained that nothing can be done about the appointment now that she has been sworn in.

n. Dora informed that group that the complainant has emailed him about his concerns.

o. The subject of free speech came up. Vanhorssen reminded that group that the November 23 Town Hall meeting subject is Free Speech vs Hate Speech at 6:30 and is
virtual. Registration is required. If a person registers but is unable to attend the live meeting they will receive all the meeting materials.

DEI Video: Shyle Lions played the video she created with Kari (last name?) of The Momentum Center, which was edited by Dennis Threadgill of GHAPS. A group of citizens read portions of the HRC diversity equity and inclusion statement in English and Spanish. The video will be used for various purposes and be available on the City and HRC websites/social media.

Agency Updates: Vanhorssen gave an update about the Momentum Center. Due to the new MDHHS orders they are closed to the public but have many remote services available. Kleyn gave a brief update about housing services specifically related to the CARES Act forbearance.

Second Call to the Audience - no comments.

Motion to adjourn at 7:09 by Vanhorssen, seconded by Lyons, all in favor.

Next meeting December 17 2020 via Zoom at 5:30 p.m.
City of Grand Haven Human Relations Commission
Alleged Discrimination Complaint Form

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Complainant Name:</th>
<th>Address:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>James O'Neal</td>
<td>207 Valley Court</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City, State, Zip:</th>
<th>Phone Number:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grand Haven, MI 49417</td>
<td>616-443-9531</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of Incident:</th>
<th>Time of Incident:</th>
<th>Location of Incident:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11/2/2020</td>
<td>7pm</td>
<td>City Hall</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All information provided on this form will be kept confidential to the extent it is possible. Please understand that if you wish for your complaint to be investigated it may not be possible for all information to be kept confidential.

For complete details of how this complaint will be handled please review the HRC policies and procedures on the boards and commissions page at www.grandhaven.org.

Complaint Information (please be specific) Attach additional pages if needed

Grand Haven Mayor Monetza nominated Nancy Nagtzaam to the Duncan Park commission to represent the people of Grand Haven. Council Member Dennis Scott read a letter that Mrs. Nagtzaam sent to then Mayor Geri McCabe. Mrs. Nagtzaam didn't agree with Mayor McCabe's decision on a political issue. In the letter that Councilman Scott read, Mrs. Nagtzaam wrote saying "You evil, crazy, Closet Dyke, Bitch. My hope and prayer everyday is that you die from some terrible cancerous disease". Councilman Scott recommended that she not be appointed to represent the people. He stated "This is Hate... we should be careful who we put on boards". Mayor Monetza stated "There were a lot of hard times and emotions... I don't want to bring up bad press on people."

Councilman Cummins rightly stated that she had used a "deragatory LGBQT term". The City of Grand Haven has values listed on the website. Appointing a person to represent the citizens of Grand Haven that could write something like that over a political issue goes directly against the Values posted and violates the Inclusiveness Policy and promote hate against LGBQT.
The City Council should not appoint Mrs. Nagtzaam to represent anyone from Grand Haven.

The City Council Members that voted for the appointment of Mrs. Nagtzaam should be sanctioned.

Complainant Signature:  

[Signature]

Date:  

11/5/2020

Form can be emailed:  

ATTENTION: HUMAN RELATIONS CHAIRPERSON to

ghhousing@grandhaven.org

NHS

ATTN: HUMAN RELATIONS CHAIRPERSON

11 N. 6th Street

Grand Haven MI 49417

Staff Use Only  

Date: 11/5/2020  

Case Number: 2020-01  

Received By: Rhonda Kleyn

Assigned Investigator(s): HRC Members